

*JLG meeting - Wednesday 16<sup>th</sup> May 2012*  
*Minutes*

**Attendees**

Rachel Alcock (RA)	WSPA
Margaret Balaskas (MB)	WSPA
Mark Baxter (MBr)	Defra
Guy Clarke (GC)	UK Border Force
Jim Collins (JC)	SUN
Sally Cunningham (SC)	Defra
John David (JD)	RHS
Jane Elliot-Malpass (JEM)	Defra
Vin Fleming (VF)	JNCC
John Gripper (JG)	Sebakwe Black Rhino Trust
Madeleine Groves (MG)	RBG Kew
Louise Hartley (LH)	WCL
Graham Irving (GI)	The Hawk Board
Mark Jones (MJ)	HSI
Pieter Kat (PK)	LionAid
Andrew Kelly (AK)	RSPCA
Alison Littlewood (AL)	JNCC
Miriam Lugg (ML)	WCL

Kim McDonald (KmD)	Guild of Taxidermists
Christine Macsween (CmS)	LionAid
Philip Mansbridge (PM)	CWI
Chris Newman (CN)	FBH
Fran Nicholls (FN)	AHVLA
Clare Palmer (CP)	BUAV
Vassili Papastavrou (VF)	IFAW
Tom Quinn (TQ)	IFAW
Ian Redmond (IR)	GRASP
Mary Rice (MR)	EIA
Caroline Rigg (CR)	AHVLA
Derek Stotton (DS)	The Hawk Board
Chris Smith (CS)	NCA
Heather Sohl (HS)	WWF UK
John Spires (JS)	British Orchid Council
Shelley Waterland (SW)	Born Free Foundation
Dominic Whitmee (DW)	Defra

**Agenda item 1**

Welcome and Introductions  
TS welcomed the group.

**Agenda item 2**

The minutes of the last meeting were agreed with one amendment noted and updated. JEM updated progress on action points arising at the last meeting.

**Agenda item 3**

Defra updates and re-structure of the Department

TS explained the new Defra high level structure which came in effect on 2 April 2012. Francis Marlow, previously the Deputy Director covering CITES, has changed jobs and is to be replaced by Jeremy Eppel from the beginning of June. Martin Brasher is holding the 'CITES' reins until the end of May, when he retires.

TS said that additionally, heads of branch were going through a matching process, and that this process would cascade down to other grades with changes taking place up until September.. At this time it was not known how any changes will affect the CITES team, if they will at all.

CR reported no changes at AHVLA since the last JLG meeting other than Nevin (Hunter), former head of compliance, has now moved to head the UK NWCU. His post is currently being recruited.

MG reported that a replacement has been found for Lucy Garrett, CITES officer, who left Kew recently and will provide details ASAP.

GC reported that, as announcement in February 2012, front line customs officers who had been employed by the UK Border Agency transferred to the UK Border Force (UKBF) on 1 March 2012. UKBF was to be a standalone agency of the Home Office and CITES policy remains the responsibility of UKBA.

**Action Point: JEM will update JLG members once staffing is finalised**

**Agenda item 4**

Legislation/policy issues

a. EU wildlife trade review

TS reported that the final drafts of the revised EU Wildlife Trade Regulation were in their final stages and are expected to be in force this Summer. A number of guidance notes have been agreed at EU level with agreement needed on a number of others.

**Action Point: JEM to provide JLG members with the latest draft and update as necessary**

b. COTES

TS said that due to resourcing and other pressing priorities the timetable for reviewing the COTES regulations (Enforcement and Ports of Entry and Exit) had slipped. The timetable would now see informal consultation this summer with a full public consultation by the beginning of 2013. Expected implementation date for COTES is most likely now to be not until April 2014.

**Action Point: JEM will keep JLG members updated on progress**

c. Fees

DW reported on the latest position on the CITES charging review. Two options are being proposed:

- Immediate full cost recovery (FCR)
- A phased approach to FCR, with a 25% increase in fees proposed for the first phase.

The main difference from the current system is that different rates are proposed for processing applications of fauna or flora due to differing costs of scientific advice, and the introduction of a £1.50 charge for each permit or certificate issued after the first in relation to a single application. DS asked DW if he could write to him with a specific enquiry on the proposed new charges.

The introduction of any increases has been delayed. The Consultation's impact assessment (IA) has been finalised and the formal consultation exercise is expected to start in June. A first phase of increases is therefore unlikely before January 2013. DW emphasised the importance of traders providing clear evidence of the impact of fees on their businesses.

**Action Point:** DW to circulate a note of the proposed fees and a summary of the informal consultation to traders ASAP

*Secretaries' note: information circulated 17/05/2012*

d. Enforcement

i. CAWT

TS reported that the UK handed over the Chair of the Coalition Against Wildlife Trafficking (CAWT) to Australia on 1 May 2012 in accordance with CAWT's rules which say that the Chair should rotate on a two yearly basis.

ii. NCA

TS informed the group of the latest developments on the NCA and its Border Police Force (BPC), a shadow organisation is now running as a pilot. TS reassured JLG that wildlife trading remains on their radar and is a key element for UKBF.

**Action Point:** TS to update JLG on any developments position in NCA.

**Agenda item 5**

Review of recent meetings (with linked short summaries where available)

a. EWG 24 - 19-20 April 2012

Not discussed in depth in absence of Nevin Hunter. In future a brief summary of discussions, where appropriate, would be circulated for information

b. SRG 59 – 23 February 2012, [Agenda Summary](#)

CN asked if SRG had agreed on how to measure scorpions (*Pandinus imperator*). AL said that a means of identifying the 10cm measurement had been agreed by SRG and a diagram was available with the points from which the animal should be measured.

**Action Point:** AL to circulate a copy of the diagram to JLG

CmS asked what discussions had taken place about *Panthera leo* at Agenda items 11 and 12 (A11 - Lion conservation and A12 – UNEP-WCMC Review of from trading African range States (excluding South Africa)). AL said the LionAid note had been circulated to SRG and the WCMC review is due to be discussed once work on it is completed.

CmS expressed concern over the mislabelling of hunting trophies from S Africa (as wild taken and not captive bred). VF explained that SRG still has a negative opinion on imports of lion hunting trophies from S Africa and was not aware of any trade at the moment. The issue will be revisited once the outcomes of the LionAid workshop are known he also reported that the Commission will be consulting with lion range states on the implementation of their management plans.

c. ManCom 58 – 13 February 2012, [Agenda Summary](#)

In response to a question from SW, TS confirmed that a new Scientific Advisor has been appointed by the Commission as Marco Valentino's secondment has come to an end.

**Action Point:** JEM to provide details once available

TQ asked what will happen when the EU trade ban on rhino horn comes to an end of 2012 and if there was a criteria for agreeing whether trade could resume. TS explained that criteria needed to be agreed but he thought it would need to focus on the level of threat posed by resumed trade. It could though, he also thought, look at the scope of the stricter measure and not just whether the ban would stay in place. TS explained the reason for removing the 'high artistic value' derogation for rhino horn, i.e. that due to the widely fluctuating price of rhino horn it was not possible to decide if a specimen fell under the derogation. CR noted that the issue was discussed at Com 58 where the UK pushed for a highly precautionary approach.

- d. 26<sup>th</sup> Animals Committee – 15-20 March 2012, [AC26 docs](#) [Agenda](#) [Exec summaries](#)

SW asked if the UK had had a chance to consider the listing proposal for the West African manatee (*Trichechus senegalensis*). VF said that he had only had sight of a French version of the document but AC was not sure if the species met the listing criteria. SW said an English version of the proposal is now available.

**Action Point:** SW to forward a copy of the English version *Trichechus senegalensis* to VF

HS asked for an update on the Sharks working group at AC. VF said that some progress had been made by the group despite fears on the group's effectiveness and ability to put forward well advised proposals on shark species. VF said that the Traffic report (Sponsored by JNCC) to look at the vulnerability of commercially exploited marine species should assist with discussions on potential sharks proposals. VF said that the UK still views sharks as priority species.

HS asked for an update on the Solomon Islands that have not submitted an annual report since 2007 and if the UK would raise the issue of non submission of reports with the Secretariat (this can lead to trade suspensions). VF said that AC has discussed the review of significant trade and was not sure what else that forum could do but the issue of non compliance should be raised at SC62.

- e. 20<sup>th</sup> Plants Committee – 22-30 March, [PC20 docs](#) [Agenda](#) [Exec summaries](#)

MG reported that a number of issues discussed at PC are likely to follow though to CoP16 inc:

- Annotations
- Agarwood
- Madagascar listings
- Mahogany and tropical timber

MR asked if Thailand were likely to propose a Rosewood listing for CoP16. MG said this had been discussed but there were still some outstanding ID concerns.

#### **Agenda item 6**

Preparations for International meetings:

a. SC62 23-27 July 2012 ([SC docs](#))

TS ran through some of the practical details for SC62 (and CoP16). The UK delegation for SC62 is likely to be:

- Trevor
- Caroline
- Clare
- Dominic
- James Williams (JNCC)

And the relevant deadlines for SC62 are:

- Submission of docs – 24 May 2012
- Registration by 23 June
- Credentials – apply to JEM ASAP

And for CoP 16 – UK delegation (TBC)

- Jeremy
- Trevor
- Caroline
- Dominic
- Clare
- Marine colleague (Defra)
- Office support (AHVLA or Defra)
- Kew
- JNCC
- UKBA

**Action Point:** JEM to provide EU CoP16 timeline doc to JLG members

*Enclosed - UK timetable and NGO meetings, experts meetings, WPIEs. Jane to notify JLG members of stakeholder meetings as and when. Would be useful to have an idea of which NGOs plan on attending CoP16 – JLG to let Jane know please.*

## Species issues

### Rhino

MJ asked for an update on the rhinos working group and what form its report would take at SC62. TS confirmed that a CITES notification had been sent asking Parties to update on activities undertaken by them (Decisions [15.71 - 15.73](#) refers), for consideration by the working group. This work is ongoing and a progress report will be given to CoP16.

SW asked if the UK/EU plan to make any rhino proposals to CoP16, TS said this was dependant n the outcomes from the working group. JG asked for a UK position on verification of rhino horn stockpiles, possible future one off sales of rhino horn (in response to rumours that some Parties were considering sales) and our position on trophy hunting in S Africa and Swaziland. TS said that the current concerns meant that it was highly unlikely that the UK would support such proposals.

CMS noted that there has been an increase in the use of lion bones for TAMs. TQ said there was a growing trend amongst some individuals to stockpile rhino horn (as a kind of futures commodity). KmD agreed but expressed concern that restrictions can drive trade underground and that education on the use of TAMs is needed. HS and MR agreed with this view recognising the need to focus on cultural pre-conceptions on TAMs.

MR asked if the UK was involved in pushing for enforcement indicators, TS said that we would look favourably on the development of indicators which would assist with reporting enforcement efforts

**Action Point:** JLG members to let TS/JEM know of any increasing trends re; TAMs

**Action Point:** Trevor to speak to Ben Van Rensburg(Chief Enforcement Officer at the CITES Secretariat) on the issue of enforcement indicators and one or two other matters

### Long Tailed Macaques

IR asked if the UK had any comments on long tailed Macaques in our capacity as an importing country. VF said that long tailed Macaques are still in the Review of Significant trade process which will be discussed again at the next Animals Committee meeting.

IR asked if the UK was still involved in the Great Ape Task Force. TS explained there has been very little engagement with the task force and suggested IR write to him suggesting how we can re-invigorate its work.

**Action Point:** IR to write to TS on the issues of the Great Ape Task Force

### Tiger

HS said that a meeting on tigers is currently running in New Delhi and is awaiting the results of that.

MR noted that it is important that [Decision 14.69](#), [Decision 15.46](#) and [Conf Res 12.5 \(Rev. CoP15\)](#) are complied with particularly in respect of Asian Big Cats (ABCs). MR asked the UK to press for other Parties to comply with the above. TS said that he and MB are due to discuss this issue very shortly and for MR to write to MB with EIA's concerns. MR said that EIA had heard a rumour that the Ministry of Agriculture in Viet Nam had made an internal proposal to use farmed tiger parts in trade.

**Action Point:** MR to write to MB ASAP on the compliance issues and with further information on the proposed trade in Viet Nam if available

### Elephants/Ivory

SW asked what the latest position was on a proposed panel of experts for elephants. TS believed that the suggestion had been made to the Secretariat but that he would try and find out the latest position.

Discussion then centre on the proposed Decision Making Mechanism (DMM) process for future ivory sales. TS reported that a draft report on the DMM had been circulated to range states and consumer countries, plus the UK, USA and TRAFFIC, for initial review. TS explained he could not give details of the report but the UK had suggested a number of amendments were required to it. TQ said that IFAW thought the report needed to further analyse the 'Kimberley Process' which is used for diamond sales which he understood it suggested as a future model for ivory sales. TS expected to see a revised report, that address the UK's and others comments, ready for SC62.

SW asked for an update on Thailand and issues on enforcement and the trade in live elephants. MB said that the CITES Secretariat (and the UK) have been in touch, and that our Thai Embassy had confirmed that Thailand was planning a review of their wildlife legislation, with plans are to introduce specific elephants' legislation. HS thought draft legislation may be in process.

SW asked for an update [Res Conf 10.10 \(Rev CoP 15\)](#) and the MIKE/ETIS working group. MBr said he had seen proposed amendments to Con Res 10.10 regarding the MIKE/ETIS elements but the UK had no concerns on the proposed amendments.

### **Lions**

CmS asked if the results of the Periodic Review on lions would be made available to SC62. VF confirmed he had not seen anything as yet but TS was hopeful that Kenya would be able to give a verbal update at SC62.

CmS asked where the UK would stand on a potential uplisting proposal for lions. TS explained we would need to see a copy of a proposal first. He confirmed though that the UK was supportive of the outcomes from the LionAid meeting in March, and shared LionAid's desire for buy-in to any proposal for lions by all range states.

TQ asked how many range states were needed for the Periodic Review process to proceed. VF confirmed that there was no fixed number.

### **Frogs**

MJ asked for the UK view on a possible listing proposal for some species of frog which are used for culinary purposes. TS confirmed that France has been asked by ManCom to consider a report by Pro-Life on the issue and would report to COM 59. SRG are considering preparing an Inf Doc for CoP16.

### **Polar bears**

MJ mentioned the possible up-listing proposal for some polar bear populations and asked for the UK view on this. TS again said that the UK would need to see proposals before offering any opinion. MJ said that he had heard that Poland have refused an import polar bear skins from one of the sub populations. AL reported that said this issue had been deferred to SRG 60 on 7 June 2012.

### **Flora**

MG reported that the most likely plants issues for SC62 and CoP16 are:

- The use of annotations
- Issues related to Madagascan plant species and enforcement
- Agarwood
- Tropical timers listings

### **Sei whale**

VP drew the group's attention to Japan's continuing take of Sei whale.

**Action Point:** VP to let TS know of his concerns

- Policy issues

*JLG meeting - Wednesday 16<sup>th</sup> May 2012  
Minutes*

SW asked about the periodic review process which had been discussed at SC61, following that the EU were going to submit suggestions for changing/improving the process. VF said this had been discussed at the joint AC/PC meeting in March and the EU needed to look at this again.

The meeting noted the following additional species which may be subject to proposals at CoP16 :

- Polar bears (Up-listing some populations)
- Madagascan plants
- Porbeagle (EU)/other shark species (US)
- Gyr falcon (downlisting proposal)
- Animals Committee – downlisting/de-listing some extinct species

The US Fish and Wildlife Service have published on the Federal register their possible proposals at:

<http://www.fws.gov/international/newspubs/fedregnot.html> and  
<http://www.fws.gov/international/CITES/CoP16/3rdFederalRegisterNoticeWeb.pdf>

**Action Point:** Defra/JEM to keep JLG in the loop on CoP preparations and circulate the EU timetable

#### **AOB**

- Update on CBNRM meeting, May 2011

MJ asked for an update on what had happened to the outcomes and recommendations from the workshop. TS said these had been circulated in other fora including at CMS CoP 10, TS shared his concerns that the outcomes had been cited as 'firm' recommendations at CMS CoP. He noted that Austria plan to present a Resolution on CBNRM for the IUCN congress later this year.

- Operation RAMP

RA asked for an update on Operation RAMP. CR explained that as this was a global operation she was not sure if a wider review was planned but the UK are in the process of arranging a de-brief session.

**Action Point:** WSPA to write to AHVLA if they need more information on Operation RAMP

**Date and venue of the next meeting – July 17 LNH – TBC**